



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

Index

to the Information Notes on the Court's case-law 2014 (January–February)



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Legal summaries published in the Case-law Information Notes are also available in HUDOC under [Legal Summaries](#).

The Information Note, compiled by the Court's Case-Law Information and Publications Division, contains summaries of cases examined during the month in question which the Registry considers as being of particular interest. The summaries are not binding on the Court. In the provisional version the summaries are normally drafted in the language of the case concerned, whereas the final single-language version appears in English and French respectively.

An annual index provides an overview of all the cases summarised in each calendar year. To facilitate access to materials in the Information Notes, a running cumulative index will be updated online with each new edition of the provisional version of the Note. The important cases summarised in the Information Notes are indexed by Convention Article, keyword, applicant name and respondent State. The Index also contains a list of cases which have been referred to or relinquished in favour of the Grand Chamber.

The Information Note and the index may be downloaded at <www.echr.coe.int/NoteInformation/en>. A hard-copy subscription is available for 30 euros (EUR) or 45 United States dollars (USD) per year, including eleven Information Notes plus an annual index, by contacting <publishing@echr.coe.int>.

The HUDOC database is available free-of-charge through the Court's Internet site (<<http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/>>). It provides access to the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber, Chamber and Committee judgments, decisions, communicated cases, advisory opinions and legal summaries from the Case-Law Information Note), the European Commission of Human Rights (decisions and reports) and the Committee of Ministers (resolutions).

European Court of Human Rights
(Council of Europe)
67075 Strasbourg Cedex
France
Tel: 00 33 (0)3 88 41 20 18
Fax: 00 33 (0)3 88 41 27 30
publishing@echr.coe.int
www.echr.coe.int

ISSN 1996-1545

© Council of Europe / European Court of Human Rights, 2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD.....	7
ARTICLE 2.....	7
Jurisdiction of States.....	7
ARTICLE 2.....	7
Life.....	7
Use of force.....	7
Positive obligations (substantive aspect).....	7
Effective investigation.....	7
ARTICLE 3.....	8
Inhuman or degrading treatment.....	8
Degrading treatment.....	8
Positive obligations (substantive aspect).....	8
ARTICLE 5.....	8
Article 5 § 4.....	8
Review of lawfulness of detention.....	8
ARTICLE 6.....	9
Article 6 § 1 (civil).....	9
Adversarial trial / Equality of arms.....	9
Article 6 § 1 (criminal).....	9
Access to court.....	9
Article 6 § 2.....	9
Presumption of innocence.....	9
ARTICLE 8.....	9
Respect for private and family life.....	9
Respect for private life.....	9
Respect for family life.....	9
Expulsion.....	10

ARTICLE 10	10
Freedom of expression.....	10
ARTICLE 14	10
Discrimination (Article 8).....	10
Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1).....	10
ARTICLE 35	10
Article 35 § 1	10
Exhaustion of domestic remedies	10
Effective domestic remedy – Estonia	11
Effective domestic remedy – Turkey.....	11
Six-month period	11
Article 35 § 3	11
Abuse of the right of application	11
Article 46	11
Execution of a judgment – General measures	11
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1	11
Possessions.....	11
Control of the use of property.....	12
ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1	12
Right to education.....	12
ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4	12
Article 2 § 1	12
Freedom of movement.....	12
CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERRAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER	13
CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE	14
Bulgaria.....	14
Cyprus.....	14
Estonia	14

Finland	14
France.....	14
Germany.....	14
Ireland	14
Italy	14
Portugal	15
Romania.....	15
Russia.....	15
Serbia	15
Slovakia	15
Switzerland	15
Turkey.....	15
United Kingdom	16
CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT	17

CASES LISTED BY CONVENTION ARTICLE AND KEYWORD

ARTICLE 2

Jurisdiction of States

Absence of territorial jurisdiction in respect of immigrant applicant who had voluntarily returned to his country of origin

Khan v. the United Kingdom (dec.), no. 11987/11, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

ARTICLE 2

Life

Death of 6 children as a result of failure to secure and supervise firing range containing unexploded ordnance: *violation*

Oruk v. Turkey, no. 33647/04, 4 February 2014.....no. 171

Inadequacies of investigation into use of lethal force by police officers resulting in deaths of father and his 13 year old son: *violation*

Makbule Kaymaz and Others v. Turkey, no. 651/10, 25 February 2014.....no. 171

Use of force

Inadequacies of investigation into use of lethal force by police officers resulting in deaths of father and his 13 year old son: *violation*

Makbule Kaymaz and Others v. Turkey, no. 651/10, 25 February 2014.....no. 171

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Death of man suffering from psychiatric disorder as a result of police attempts to hospitalise him by force: *violation*

Shchiborshch and Kuzmina v. Russia, no. 5269/08, 16 January 2014no. 170

Death of six children as a result of failure to secure and supervise firing range containing unexploded ordnance: *violation*

Oruk v. Turkey, no. 33647/04, 4 February 2014.....no. 171

Effective investigation

Death of man suffering from psychiatric disorder as a result of police attempts to hospitalise him by force: *violation*

Shchiborshch and Kuzmina v. Russia, no. 5269/08, 16 January 2014no. 170

Lack of reconstitution of incident in which police officers fired in suspect's direction when arresting him: *no violation*

Camekan v. Turkey, no. 54241/08, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

Inadequacies of investigation into use of lethal force by police officers resulting in deaths of father and his 13 year old son: *violation*

Makbule Kaymaz and Others v. Turkey, no. 651/10, 25 February 2014no. 171

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman or degrading treatment

Obligation on prisoners to wear closed overalls while being held in isolation for short period: *no violation*

Lindström and Mässeli v. Finland, no. 24630/10, 14 January 2014no. 170

Lack of independent access to prison facilities for paraplegic prisoner; lack of organised assistance with his mobility and daily routine resulting in his segregation and stigmatisation: *violation*

Semikhvostov v. Russia, no. 2689/12, 6 February 2014no. 171

Use of pepper spray against an aggressive prisoner and his confinement to restraint bed for three hours and forty minutes: *violation*

Tali v. Estonia, no. 66393/10, 13 February 2014no. 171

Degrading treatment

Absence of timely reaction by the Military to a conscript's mental disorder: *violation*

Placi v. Italy, no. 48754/11, 21 January 2014no. 170

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Failure by State to put appropriate mechanisms in place to protect National School pupil from sexual abuse by teacher: *violation*

O'Keefe v. Ireland [GC], no. 35810/09, 28 January 2014no. 170

-000-

Absence of timely reaction by the Military to a conscript's mental disorder: *violation*

Placi v. Italy, no. 48754/11, 21 January 2014no. 170

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 4

Review of lawfulness of detention

Requirement to prepare a fresh independent medical opinion on a detainee's mental health when examining a request for his release from detention: *violation*

Ruiz Riviera v. Switzerland, no. 8300/06, 18 February 2014no. 171

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

Adversarial trial / Equality of arms

Failure to send respondents' submissions to applicants for either information or comment in leave-to-appeal proceedings before the Supreme Court of Cassation: *inadmissible*

Valchev and Others v. Bulgaria (dec.), nos. 47450/11, 26659/12 and 53966/12,
21 January 2014.....no. 171

Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

Access to court

Decision to strike out civil claims alleging torture on account of immunity invoked by defendant State (the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia) and its officials: *no violation*

Jones and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06,
14 January 2014.....no. 170

Article 6 § 2

Presumption of innocence

Statements concerning a suspect under investigation contained in a judgment convicting co-accused tried separately: *Article 6 § 2 applicable; no violation*

Karaman v. Germany, no. 17103/10, 27 February 2014.....no. 171

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Restrictions on family visits for life-long prisoners: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

Khoroshenko v. Russia, no. 41418/04.....no. 171

Respect for private life

Indiscriminate capture and sharing of vast quantities of communication data by state security services: *communicated*

Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 58170/13.....no. 170

Respect for family life

Full adoption order owing to mother's partial incapacity and lack of statutory power to make simple adoption order: *violation*

Zhou v. Italy, no. 33773/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 170

Expulsion

- Exclusion orders based on undisclosed national security grounds: *inadmissible*
I.R. and G.T. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), nos.14876/12 and 63339/12,
28 January 2014.....no. 171

ARTICLE 10

Freedom of expression

- Award of damages against internet news portal for offensive comments posted on its site by anonymous third parties: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*
Delfi AS v. Estonia, no. 64569/09 (*Chamber judgment of 10 October 2013*).....no. 171

-000-

- Arrest and conviction of journalist for not obeying police orders during a demonstration: *no violation*
Pentikäinen v. Finland, no. 11882/10, 4 February 2014no. 171
- Applicant's precarious financial situation as a result of award of damages for defamation against her: *violation*
Tešić v. Serbia, nos.4678/07 and 50591/12, 11 February 2014no. 171

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 8)

- Inability for married couple to give their legitimate child the wife's surname: *violation*
Cusan and Fazzo v. Italy, no. 77/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

- Refusal to award "recognition allowance" to repatriated veteran of the Algerian war on the grounds of his European, as opposed to local, origin: *no violation*
Montoya v. France, no. 62170/10, 23 January 2014.....no. 170

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Exhaustion of domestic remedies

- Failure to exhaust effective domestic remedies to obtain title to property: *inadmissible*
Dexter and Others v. Cyprus (dec.), nos. 63049/11, 68057/11 and 62322/11,
17 December 2013no. 170
- Claim for compensation before the administrative courts in respect of complaint concerning length of civil proceedings: *effective remedy*
Treial v. Estonia (dec.), no. 32897/12, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

Effective domestic remedy – Estonia

Claim for compensation before the administrative courts in respect of complaint concerning length of civil proceedings: *effective remedy*

Treial v. Estonia (dec.), no. 32897/12, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

Effective domestic remedy – Turkey

Entitlement to financial compensation under Article 141 § 1 (f) of the Code of Criminal Procedure for persons deprived of their liberty for a period exceeding the length of their sentence: *effective remedy*

Alican Demir v. Turkey, no. 41444/09, 25 February 2014.....no. 171

Six-month period

Failure to lodge timely application concerning failure of insolvent State entity to pay judgment debt: *inadmissible*

Sokolov and Others v. Serbia (dec.), nos.30859/10 et al., 14 January 2014.....no. 171

Article 35 § 3

Abuse of the right of application

Representative's failure to inform Court that he had lodged two separate applications concerning the same facts on behalf of a husband and wife: *inadmissible*

Martins Alves v. Portugal (dec.), no. 56297/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 171

ARTICLE 46

Execution of a judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to reform domestic legislation and/or practice to enable the legitimate child of a married couple to be given its mother's surname

Cusan and Fazzo v. Italy, no. 77/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

Indication that respondent State should take general measures to prevent delays and to ensure its compliance with domestic court decisions

Foundation Hostel for Students of the Reformed Church and Stanomirescu v. Romania, nos. 2699/03 and 43597/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

Respondent State required to introduce compensatory remedy to provide effective relief for breach of property rights of rent-controlled flat owners

Bittó and Others v. Slovakia, no. 30255/09, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Possessions

Ban on donating embryos for scientific research: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

Parrillo v. Italy, no. 46470/11.....no. 170

Control of the use of property _____

Rent-control scheme imposing low levels of rent on landlords: *violation*

Bittó and Others v. Slovakia, no. 30255/09, 28 January 2014no. 170

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1

Right to education _____

Alleged inability of disabled student to pursue university course owing to a lack of suitable facilities: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*

Gherghina v. Romania, no. 42219/07no. 170

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 4

Article 2 § 1

Freedom of movement _____

Inability of minor to leave State without documentation necessary to prove father's consent: *inadmissible*

Şandru v. Romania (dec.), no. 1902/11, 14 January 2014no. 171

CASES ACCEPTED FOR REFERRAL TO THE GRAND CHAMBER AND CASES IN WHICH JURISDICTION WAS RELINQUISHED BY A CHAMBER IN FAVOUR OF THE GRAND CHAMBER

REFERRAL

- Delfi AS v. Estonia, no. 64569/09 (Chamber judgment of 10 October 2013)*.....no. 171
ARTICLE 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION
Award of damages against internet news portal for offensive comments posted on its site
by anonymous third parties: *case referred to the Grand Chamber*

RELINQUISHMENTS

- Gherghina v. Romania, no. 42219/07*no. 170
ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: RIGHT TO EDUCATION
Alleged inability of disabled student to pursue university course owing to a lack of suitable
facilities: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand Chamber*
- Khoroshenko v. Russia, no. 41418/04*no. 171
ARTICLE 8: RESPECT FOR PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE
Restrictions on family visits for life-long prisoners: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand
Chamber*
- Parrillo v. Italy, no. 46470/11*no. 170
ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1: POSSESSIONS
Ban on donating embryos for scientific research: *relinquishment in favour of the Grand
Chamber*

CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY RESPONDENT STATE

Bulgaria

Decisions

Valchev and Others v. Bulgaria (dec.), nos. 47450/11, 26659/12 and 53966/12,
21 January 2014.....no. 171

Cyprus

Decisions

Dexter and Others v. Cyprus (dec.), nos. 63049/11, 68057/11 and 62322/11,
17 December 2013.....no. 170

Estonia

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Delfi AS v. Estonia, no. 64569/09 (Chamber judgment of 10 October 2013 – referral)no. 171

Judgments

Tali v. Estonia, no. 66393/10, 13 February 2014.....no. 171

Decisions

Treial v. Estonia (dec.), no. 32897/12, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

Finland

Judgments

Lindström and Mässeli v. Finland, no. 24630/10, 14 January 2014.....no. 170

Pentikäinen v. Finland, no. 11882/10, 4 February 2014.....no. 171

France

Judgments

Montoya v. France, no. 62170/10, 23 January 2014.....no. 170

Germany

Judgments

Karaman v. Germany, no. 17103/10, 27 February 2014.....no. 171

Ireland

Grand Chamber (judgments/decisions)

O’Keeffe v. Ireland [GC], no. 35810/09, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

Italy

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

Parrillo v. Italy, no. 46470/11 (relinquishment).....no. 170

Judgments

- Cusan and Fazzo v. Italy*, no. 77/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170
Placi v. Italy, no. 48754/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 170
Zhou v. Italy, no. 33773/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 170

Portugal

Decisions

- Martins Alves v. Portugal (dec.)*, no. 56297/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 171

Romania

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

- Gherghina v. Romania*, no. 42219/07 (relinquishment).....no. 170

Judgments

- Foundation Hostel for Students of the Reformed Church and Stanomirescu v. Romania*, nos. 2699/03 and 43597/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

Decisions

- Șandru v. Romania (dec.)*, no. 1902/11, 14 January 2014.....no. 171

Russia

Grand Chamber (referrals/relinquishments)

- Khoroshenko v. Russia*, no. 41418/04 (relinquishment).....no. 171

Judgments

- Semikhvostov v. Russia*, no. 2689/12, 6 February 2014.....no. 171
Shchiborshch and Kuzmina v. Russia, no. 5269/08, 16 January 2014.....no. 170

Serbia

Judgments

- Tešić v. Serbia*, nos.4678/07 and 50591/12, 11 February 2014.....no. 171

Decisions

- Sokolov and Others v. Serbia (dec.)*, nos.30859/10 et al., 14 January 2014.....no. 171

Slovakia

Judgments

- Bittó and Others v. Slovakia*, no. 30255/09, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

Switzerland

Judgments

- Ruiz Riviera v. Switzerland*, no. 8300/06, 18 February 2014.....no. 171

Turkey

Judgments

- Alican Demir v. Turkey*, no. 41444/09, 25 February 2014.....no. 171
Camekan v. Turkey, no. 54241/08, 28 January 2014.....no. 170
Makbule Kaymaz and Others v. Turkey, no. 651/10, 25 February 2014.....no. 171

Oruk v. Turkey, no. 33647/04, 4 February 2014.....no. 171

United Kingdom

Judgments

Jones and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06,
14 January 2014.....no. 170

Decisions

I.R. and G.T. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), nos.14876/12 and 63339/12,
28 January 2014.....no. 171

Khan v. the United Kingdom (dec.), no. 11987/11, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

Communicated cases

Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 58170/13.....no. 170

CASES LISTED ALPHABETICALLY BY APPLICANT

- A -

Alican Demir v. Turkey, no. 41444/09, 25 February 2014no. 171

- B -

Big Brother Watch and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 58170/13 (communicated case).....no. 170

Bittó and Others v. Slovakia, no. 30255/09, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

- C -

Camekan v. Turkey, no. 54241/08, 28 January 2014.....no. 170

Cusan and Fazzo v. Italy, no. 77/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

- D -

Delfi AS v. Estonia, no. 64569/09 (Chamber judgment of 10 October 2013 – referral).....no. 171

Dexter and Others v. Cyprus (dec.), nos. 63049/11, 68057/11 and 62322/11, 17 December 2013.....no. 170

- F -

Foundation Hostel for Students of the Reformed Church and Stanomirescu v. Romania, nos. 2699/03 and 43597/07, 7 January 2014.....no. 170

- G -

Gherghina v. Romania, no. 42219/07 (relinquishment).....no. 170

- I -

I.R. and G.T. v. the United Kingdom (dec.), nos. 14876/12 and 63339/12, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

- J -

Jones and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06, 14 January 2014no. 170

- K -

<i>Karaman v. Germany</i> , no. 17103/10, 27 February 2014	no. 171
<i>Khan v. the United Kingdom (dec.)</i> , no. 11987/11, 28 January 2014.....	no. 171
<i>Khoroshenko v. Russia</i> , no. 41418/04 (relinquishment).....	no. 171

- L -

<i>Lindström and Mässeli v. Finland</i> , no. 24630/10, 14 January 2014.....	no. 170
--	---------

- M -

<i>Makbule Kaymaz and Others v. Turkey</i> , no. 651/10, 25 February 2014	no. 171
<i>Martins Alves v. Portugal (dec.)</i> , no. 56297/11, 21 January 2014	no. 171
<i>Montoya c. France</i> , n° 62170/10, 23 janvier 2014.....	n° 170

- O -

<i>O’Keeffe v. Ireland [GC]</i> , no. 35810/09, 28 January 2014	no. 170
<i>Oruk v. Turkey</i> , no. 33647/04, 4 February 2014.....	no. 171

- P -

<i>Parrillo v. Italy</i> , no. 46470/11 (relinquishment)	no. 170
<i>Pentikäinen v. Finland</i> , no. 11882/10, 4 February 2014	no. 171
<i>Placi v. Italy</i> , no. 48754/11, 21 January 2014	no. 170

- R -

<i>Ruiz Riviera v. Switzerland</i> , no. 8300/06, 18 February 2014	no. 171
--	---------

- S -

<i>Șandru v. Romania (dec.)</i> , no. 1902/11, 14 January 2014.....	no. 171
<i>Semikhvostov v. Russia</i> , no. 2689/12, 6 February 2014.....	no. 171
<i>Shchiborshch and Kuzmina v. Russia</i> , no. 5269/08, 16 January 2014.....	no. 170
<i>Sokolov and Others v. Serbia (dec.)</i> , nos.30859/10 et al., 14 January 2014	no. 171

- T -

<i>Tali v. Estonia</i> , no. 66393/10, 13 February 2014	no. 171
<i>Tešić v. Serbia</i> , nos.4678/07 and 50591/12, 11 February 2014.....	no. 171

Treial v. Estonia (dec.), no. 32897/12, 28 January 2014.....no. 171

- V -

Valchev and Others v. Bulgaria (dec.), nos.47450/11, 26659/12 and 53966/12,
21 January 2014.....no. 171

- Z -

Zhou v. Italy, no. 33773/11, 21 January 2014.....no. 170